# **Exploring Written Artefacts**

Objects, Methods, and Concepts

Volume 1

Edited by Jörg B. Quenzer

**DE GRUYTER** 

ISBN 978-3-11-074545-0 e-ISBN (PDF) 978-3-11-075330-1 e-ISBN (EPUB) 978-3-11-075334-9 ISSN 2365-9696 DOI https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110753301



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

#### Library of Congress Control Number: 2021938817

#### Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at http://dnb.dnb.de.

© 2021 with the authors; editing © Jörg B. Quenzer, published by Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston Printing and binding: CPI books GmbH, Leck

www.degruyter.com

## **Contents**

#### Volume I

Jörg B. Quenzer

Introduction: In Honour of Michael Friedrich — XIII

# **Matters of Materiality**

Alessandro Bausi

'Paleografia quale scienza dello spirito': Once More on the  $Ge^{\circ}$  Inscription of Ham ( $RI\acute{E}$  no. 232) — 3

Kaja Harter-Uibopuu

Multiple-Text Inscriptions in the Greco-Roman World — 35

Lothar Ledderose

Engrave on the Heart and Wash Away Care — 53

Piotr Michalowski

They Wrote on Clay, Wax, and Stone: Some Thoughts on Early Mesopotamian Writing —— 67

Cécile Michel

What about 3D Manuscripts? The Case of the Cuneiform Clay Tablets — 89

Ondřej Škrabal

How Were Bronze Inscriptions Cast in Ancient China? New Answers to Old Questions —— 115

Barend I. ter Haar

What Inscriptions do not Tell You about Themselves: Chinese Cases — 139

# Measuring, Analysing, Computing

Claudia Colini, Ivan Shevchuk, Kyle Ann Huskin, Ira Rabin, Oliver Hahn A New Standard Protocol for Identification of Writing Media —— 161

Marina Creydt, Markus Fischer

Mass Spectrometry-Based Proteomics and Metaproteomics Analysis of Ancient Manuscripts —— 183

Oliver Hahn, Uwe Golle, Carsten Wintermann, Domenico Laurenza Scientific Analysis of Leonardo's *Manuscript with Anatomic Drawings and Notes* —— 213

Boriana Mihailova, Jochen Schlüter, Kaja Harter-Uibopuu

Inscribed Gems: Material Profiling beyond Visible Examination —— 229

Ralf Möller

Humanities-Centred Artificial Intelligence (CHAI) as an Emerging Paradigm — 245

Stefan Thiemann

How Can Research on Written Artefacts Benefit from Collaboration with Computer Science? —— 267

# **Changing Media**

Camillo A. Formigatti

Notes on the Terminology for Print in Early Sanskrit Printed Books — 281

Marco Heiles

Media Systems and Genre Conventions in Transition: A German *Priamel* Booklet from Nuremberg, c. 1490 — 307

Shamil Jeppie

About a Manuscript on Tea Found in Timbuktu, Mali: Mamma Haidara Collection, MS 125, *Tārīkh al-shāy fī 'l-Maghrib* —— 333

Sabine Kienitz

From Mouth to Ear to Hand: Literacy as Recorded Orality in Nineteenth- and Early Twentieth-Century German Courts —— 345

# **Realms of Codicology**

Patrick Andrist, Marilena Maniaci

The Codex's Contents: Attempt at a Codicological Approach — 369

Malachi Beit-Arié

The Advantages of Comparative Codicology: Further Examples — 395

Nuria de Castilla, François Déroche

About a Series of Late Medieval Moroccan Bindings — 405

Agnieszka Helman-Ważny

A Tale of Papermaking along the Silk Road — 423

Tilman Seidensticker

Cataloguing Arabic Manuscripts for the Project 'Katalogisierung der Orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland' —— 441

## Repositories of Knowledge

Antonella Brita, Janina Karolewski

Unravelling Multiple-Text Manuscripts: Introducing Categories Based on Content, Use, and Production —— 459

Imre Galambos

Chinese Character Variants in Medieval Dictionaries and Manuscripts — 491

Matthieu Husson

The Art of Astrological Computations: Conrad Heingarter and the Manuscript Paris, BnF latin 7295A —— 513

Michael Kohs, Giuseppe Veltri

Magic in the Hebrew-Manuscript Collection of the Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Hamburg: Observations on Cod. hebr. 252 — 533

Jürgen Paul

Notes on a Central Asian Notebook — 563

Stefano Valente

Creating an Original of a Greek Lexicon in the Middle Ages: Notes on the Manuscript *Vaticanus Barberinianus* gr. 70 of the *Etymologicum Gudianum* — 583

#### Volume II

#### **Paracontent**

Christian Brockmann

A Multilayered Greek Manuscript of Learning: Some Glimpses into the Scribal Practices Evident in the Aristotelean Codex *Vaticanus graecus* 244 — 603

Heidi Buck-Albulet

From 'Task' to 'Title'? Japanese Linked Poetry and the Fushimono — 623

Jost Gippert

Hidden Colophons — 647

Volker Grabowsky

Sealed Manuscripts in Laos: New Findings from Luang Prabang — 667

Eva Wilden

Naming the Author: The Taṇṭi Motif in the Margins of the Tamil Poetic Tradition — 689

#### **Visual Matters**

**Dmitry Bondarev** 

A Typology of West African Ajami Manuscripts: Languages, Layout and Research Perspectives — 707

Andreas Janke

Forgery and Appreciation of Old Choir Books in Nineteenth-Century Europe —— 729

Luigi Orlandi

A Lesser-Known Member of Bessarion's Milieu: The Scribe-Bishop Makarios — 753

Bruno Reudenbach

Enigmatic Calligraphy: Lettering as Visualized Hermeneutic of Sacred Scripture —— 773

Dick van der Meij

Sailing-Ships and Character Illustrations in Three Javanese Literary Poetic Manuscripts —— 795

Hanna Wimmer

Peripatetic Readers and a Dancing Maiden: Marginal Multigraphic Discourse in a Medieval Latin Multiple-Text Manuscript —— 821

## **Rethinking Philology**

William G. Boltz

Textual Criticism and Early Chinese Manuscripts — 845

Giovanni Ciotti

Notes for an Ontological Approach within Manuscript Studies: Object Oriented Ontology and the Pothi Manuscript Culture — 865

Max Jakob Fölster, Thies Staack

Collation in Early Imperial China: From Administrative Procedure to Philological

Markus Friedrich

Loss and Circumstances: How Early Modern Europe Discovered the 'Material Text' —— 913

Michael Grünbart

The Letters of Michael Psellos and their Function in Byzantine Epistolary Culture —— 933

Felix Heinzer

*Preaching with the Hands*: Notes on Cassiodorus' Praise of Handwriting and its Medieval Reception —— 947

### Performance and Ritual

David Holm

Where did the Ngạn People Come From? Ritual Manuscripts among the Ngạn in Northern Vietnam —— 967

Oliver Huck

(Re-)Writing Jazz: The Manuscripts of John Coltrane's A Love Supreme — 989

Silpsupa Jaengsawang

A Ritual Manual of Healing: The Body-Balance of the Four Elements and the Four Key Factors of Manuscript Production and Usage —— 1005

Charles Ramble

The Volvelle and the *Lingga*: The Use of Two Manuscript Ritual Devices in a Tibetan Exorcism —— 1025

Martin Jörg Schäfer

'Vu et approuvé': Censorship Notes in Hamburg Prompt Books from the French Period —— 1043

# **Transmission in Time and Space**

Paola Buzi

The Unusual Story of a Wandering Book and its Physical Metamorphosis—1063

**Uta Lauer** 

Joint Forces: A Handscroll by Zhao Mengfu and Guan Daosheng — 1077

Zhenzhen Lu

Touched by a Tale of Friendship: An Early Nineteenth-Century *Zidishu* Manuscript —— 1099

#### **Charles Melville**

On Some Manuscripts of Hatifi's *Timurnama* — 1123

Contributors — 1147

#### **Indices**

Index of Manuscripts and Other Written Artefacts —— 1155 General Index —— 1161

#### Paola Buzi

# The Unusual Story of a Wandering Book and its Physical Metamorphosis

**Abstract:** Manuscripts are movable objects and colophons normally represent the most efficient means of tracing the paths taken by a book during its (sometimes) extended life. This short article deals with an unusual case of a manuscript and of the work it contains, whose itinerant life is narrated by a long and extraordinary title that provides surprising technical details about the book form, the writing material, and the historical events surrounding it.

About twenty years ago, I came across a title attributed to a homily – the Sahidic version of the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* (CC 0323) –, which was unusual in respect of its length and content.¹ At that time, I was greatly interested in the cultural phenomenon of the creation of new long (sometimes extremely long) titles attributed to old works, in order to actualize literary creations that had been written centuries before. Such a phenomenon led the Copts, between the eighth and the ninth centuries, to re-think their entire literary production, discarding what had become old-fashioned and re-shaping, also by means of titles, what was perceived to be still useful. My interest was so focused on that aspect and on the consequent classification of titles in categories,² according to their length and combination of *formulae*, that I noticed only superficially the other elements of interest of that exceptional title.

Thus, I believe that it is useful to briefly go back to the content of that title, which tells of the itinerant life of a manuscript (and the work it contains), with a series of unusual technical details – at least for the Coptic tradition – related to its tradition.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Buzi 2001.

<sup>2</sup> Buzi 2004; Buzi 2005.

**<sup>3</sup>** If today I am able to see beyond, this is also due to Michael Friedrich and the stimulating series of cultural initiatives that he has organized and promoted within the activities of the Centre for the Study of Manuscript Cultures, having at its core the *manuscript*, in all its possible forms and in its indivisible dual nature of physical object and intellectual product. The first time that I was invited at to CSMC as a speaker was at the conference *One-Volume Libraries: Composite Manuscripts and Multiple Text Manuscripts* (October 2010), whose results were later published in Friedrich and Schwarke 2016. At that time, I had little experience with the material

# 1 The Sahidic title of the *Life of Maximus and Domitius*

As is well known, books are movable objects. They may change their owner or simply can be produced in a place, to be later given or, as a result of a purchase, transferred to another place.<sup>4</sup> Colophons can often help to follow the itinerant life of books, also by virtue of their documentary nature, providing a series of sociological, devotional and historical data. Titles, on the other hand, do not do this, despite the fact that Coptic titles are sometimes extremely long and, compared to other Christian oriental manuscript cultures, unusually rich in information.

The title attributed to the Sahidic version of the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* is an exception. This work is preserved by two semi-complete codices, one in Sahidic, <sup>5</sup> from the Fayyūm, and one in Bohairic, <sup>6</sup> from Scetis (Wādī el-Naṭrūn), and two very fragmentary manuscripts, both in Sahidic and from the White Monastery. <sup>7</sup> It is the title of the Sahidic semi-complete codex that is of interest to us here. <sup>8</sup>

Found in 1910 in the archaeological remains of the Monastery of the Archangel Michael, near present-day Hamūli, the original codex, datable between

aspects of Coptic books, since my main research interests ranged from Coptic literature to late antique Egyptian archaeology. I can honestly say that that experience, together with the participation in the networking project *Comparative Oriental Manuscript Studies*, opened up a new world to me.

<sup>4</sup> If one does not want to mention here the well-known phenomenon of the codices that were produced at Touton (Fayyūm) for the White Monastery (Emmel 2005, 63–70: 66; Nakano 2006, 147–159), a remarkable example of the itinerant life of a manuscript is represented by CLM 1 = CMCL.AA, a Bohairic-Arabic manuscript, which was manufactured in the Wādī el-Naṭrūn, but stored in Babylon (Cairo), from 1398, as the Arabic note (not a real colophon in fact) of Matthew, patriarch of Alexandria, attests (Vat. copt. 2, fol. v<sup>r</sup>). The original codicological unit is now divided into three shelf marks: Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Vat. copt. 2, 3, and 4; <a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts/1">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts/1</a>. All websites quoted in this article were accessed on 19 May 2021.

**<sup>5</sup>** CLM 240 = MICH.BO.

**<sup>6</sup>** Vatican City, BAV, Vat. copt. 67.2, fols 34–68 = CLM 143 = MACA.DH, second half of the tenth century.

<sup>7</sup> London, British Library, Or. 3581B, fols 55–56 = CLM 1855 and London, British Library, Or. 6954, fol. 52 = CLM 1856.

<sup>8</sup> Depuydt 1993, 332-335 (no. 165), 627-628 (no. 412).

the ninth and the first half of the following century, is now dismembered in five shelf marks, and preserved in four different institutions:<sup>9</sup>

- New York, Morgan Library and Museum, M.584: 20 leaves.<sup>10</sup>
- Cairo, Coptic Museum, MS 3818: 4 leaves (hereafter CCa).
- Cairo, Coptic Museum, MS 3814: 23 leaves (hereafter CCb).
- Cairo, Coptic Museum, MS 3817 (lower cover).<sup>11</sup>
- Strasbourg, Bibliothèque nationale et universitaire, MS 583 (a single leaf).

While the Bohairic title consists of a simple, though long summary of the plot of the homily,<sup>12</sup> the Sahidic one<sup>13</sup> contains several intriguing additions that do not have anything to do with the content of the work, but rather with its daring tradition:<sup>14</sup>

Subject (2\text{171006CIC})\(^{15}\) of the life of the Roman saints Maximus and Domitius, sons of Valentinus, emperor of the Romans, who completed a good life full of all virtues and who also fulfilled at all the commands of the Gospels. The one died on the 14<sup>th</sup> of the month T\(^{0}be, the other on the 17<sup>th</sup> of the same month. It was recounted by *Apa* Pshoi of

**<sup>9</sup>** For more details about the codicological description of this codex, see the record compiled by Francesco Valerio and Eliana Dal Sasso for the *Archaeological Atlas of Coptic Literature*: <a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts/240">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts/240</a>.

**<sup>10</sup>** It was purchased in Paris in 1911 for Pierpont Morgan from Arthur Sambon, a dealer acting on behalf of a consortium of owners including a certain J. Kalebdian, and later restored and rebound in the Apostolic Vatican Library in the early 1920s.

<sup>11</sup> CCa, CCb and MS 3817 were acquired by the Egyptian Museum in Cairo, where they were given the inventory numbers of the Journal d'Entrée in 1923, and transferred to the Coptic Museum in 1939. In the CMCL database, CCb is dealt with as a separate codicological unit, not as a part of MICH.BO = CLM 240, while MS 3817 is not included. CCb fol. 1 was eventually transferred to the Museum in Port Said (Egypt), where it bears the call number 3957A.

<sup>12 &#</sup>x27;The life of the Roman saints Maximus and Domitius, sons of Valentinus, emperor of the Romans, who completed a good life full of all virtues and who, during it, also fulfilled all the commands of the Gospels. One, Maximus, died on the 14<sup>th</sup> of the month Tōbe, the other, Domitius, on the 17<sup>th</sup> of the same month. It was recounted by Apa Pshoi of Constantinople, the first deacon who lived in Shiet (Scetis) with *Apa* Macarius, man of God, and *Apa* Isidoros who died a deacon. *Apa* Moses the Ethiopian was appointed in his place. *Apa* Pshoi wrote the life of the saints as a memorial and he left it in the church as a benefit for all those who wanted to live in accordance with God. Amen'.

<sup>13 &</sup>lt;a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/titles/287">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/titles/287</a>.

<sup>14</sup> In italics, the passages that are analysed more in detail in these pages. On the relation of paratext/paracontent see Ciotti et al. 2018, <a href="https://www.manuscript-cultures.uni-hamburg.de/papers/CSMC\_Occasional\_Paper\_6\_TNT.pdf">https://www.manuscript-cultures.uni-hamburg.de/papers/CSMC\_Occasional\_Paper\_6\_TNT.pdf</a>. On the concept of paratext see also Andrist 2018.

**<sup>15</sup>** For a reflection on the meaning of this unusual term that is used to define the literary genre the work belongs to, see Buzi 2001, 525–526.

Constantinople, the first deacon who lived with Apa Macarius, a man of God, and Apa Isidorus. He died as a deacon. Apa Moses the Ethiopian was appointed in his place. Pshoi Wrote the life of the saints on a papyrus roll (eyaomoc Narthe). He left it in the church as a benefit and a memorial, for all readers, of a beautiful way of life in accordance with God and with virtue, for he met with them for some days while they were still alive when he came to Scetis. When Scetis had been laid waste by the Mastikoi, Apa Isidorus took it with him to Alexandria to the Xenon. He spoke about the life of those saints and about his great zeal for them. It then remained there until the time of *Apa* Khael, the most holy archbishop of Alexandria. It was brought to light by a deacon named Eustatios, who had found it in a large storage box of parchment books written in quaternions (0ynos инние ижишине иапас еченг егептетрас ижишине ммемвраиои), 16 when he was looking among books that might have deteriorated over time (NXWWME NTAYP 200AE ETBE HEXPONOC), for he was a servant of God. He then met a monk living in the Ennaton, who was from Scetis, and gave it to him. This is the way in which the life of those perfect saints of God was revealed. For the glory of our Lord Jesus Christ. In God's peace. Amen.

If the mention of the act of leaving a work 'in the church as a benefit and a memorial', a model for a correct and pious life, is a recurring element in Coptic literature, <sup>17</sup> all the other technical and bibliological details represent an *unicum*, not only in titles but also in other paratexts, such as colophons.

One may think that these details are completely fictional, a pure exercise of fantasy to make the reading of the work more appealing, but this is not the type of narrative feature that the authors of titles normally used to attract readers' or listeners' attention. In those cases, they rather made use of additional – compared to the content of the work – biographical details, reports of long series of

17 It appears, for instance, in the *Life of Onophrius* (CC 0254).

<sup>16</sup> Depuydt renders the term τετρας with 'in quarto': 'in a large storage box of old parchment books written in quarto', or alternatively 'in a large storage box of old books, written on parchment quires in fours'. I am inclined to exclude the first translation. The Greek *lemmata* τετράδες/τετράδα are also generically used for quires. See, purely by way of example, the colophon of the parchment codex Athena, EBE, 56 (GA 773), fol. 1', which contains a *Tetraevangelium*: '[...] This venerable and divine book of the Gospels contains thirty-six quaternions in all, with the exception of the guard leaves and those glued to the plates' (von Dobschütz 1925, 280–284; Marava-Chatzinicolaou and Toufexi-Paschou 1978, 17–26, no. 1; this colophon is being studied by Francesco Valerio within the article for the proceedings of the fourth PAThs conference, 'Christian Oriental Colophons: A Structural Analysis': <a href="http://paths.uniroma1.it/i-colofonicristiani-orientali-per-un-analisi-strutturale">http://paths.uniroma1.it/i-colofonicristiani-orientali-per-un-analisi-strutturale</a>). For the meaning of 'quaternion' see Lampe 1916, 1391. In fact, a quaternion is the quire *par excellence*. It should be stressed that the Coptic sentence is redundant, the term καωσωμε ('books') being repeated twice, in relation to the storage box ('a storage box of old books') and the writing support ('parchment books written in quires'). What is proposed here is a simplified translation, respectful of the general sense.

miraculous events, or, above all in martyrdoms, even lurid details about the death of the protagonists.<sup>18</sup>

Moreover, it appears very clear that this initial title is composed of an original narrative nucleus – that is almost identical in the Bohairic version  $-^{19}$  plus an *additamentum* that the author of the Sahidic title considered relevant for the appreciation, not only of the content of work, but also of the efforts spent to preserve it.

It is important to stress that the characters (*Apa* Pshoi, <sup>20</sup> *Apa* Macarius of Scetis, *Apa* Isidorus the deacon, *Apa* Moses the Ethiopian, <sup>21</sup> the emperor 'Valentinus', in fact Valentinianus I [364–375]) and the historical events (the sack of the barbarian people named Mastikoi/Mazikoi/Mastiques, the presence of welfare structures in Alexandria) <sup>22</sup> mentioned in the title, are real and

<sup>18</sup> A different textual phenomenon is the topos of the finding of an ancient venerable book, related to the apostolic tradition. Coptic literature preserves several examples of this phenomenon, such as the so-called Institutio Abbaton (CC 0405), whose title reads: 'An encomium which Apa Timothy, archbishop of Rakote (Alexandria), our holy father, who was glorious in all ways, delivered on the making of Abbaton, the angel of death. Our holy fathers the Apostles asked the Saviour about the (Abbaton), so that they might be able to preach about him to mankind, for they knew that men would ask them questions about everything. And the Saviour, who did not wish to disappoint them about any matter concerning which they asked questions, informed them, saying "the day on which my father created Abbaton was the 14<sup>th</sup> day of the month Hathor, and he made him king over all creations, which he had made, because of the transgression of Adam and Eve". And the archbishop wishing to learn about this fearful and terrifying being whom God made, and who pursuits every soul until it yields up its spirit in misery, when he went into Jerusalem to worship the Cross of our Saviour and his lifegiving tomb, on the 17th day of the month Thoout, searched through the books which were in the library of Jerusalem, and which had been made by our holy fathers the Apostles, and deposited by them therein, until he discovered (the account of) the creation of Abbaton, with an aged elder, who was a native of Jerusalem. When one asked him what was the occasion for the discourse he had forgotten what it was. And he spoke also on the holy apostle Saint John, theologian and virgin, who is not to taste death until the thrones are set in the valley of Josaphat, which is the place wherein the last strife of the world shall take place. In God's peace. Amen'. See also Piovanelli 1993, 25-64 and above all Piovanelli 2000, 265-282, on the case of the prologue of the Apocalypse of Paul.

**<sup>19</sup>** See above n. 12.

**<sup>20</sup>** In fact, if *Apa* Pshoi of Scetis is easily identifiable, more complex is the problem of identification of Pshoi of Constantinople, who as such is probably a fictional character, inspired by a real person. For these aspects see Buzi 2001, 527–535. See also Coquin 1991, VI, 2028–2030.

**<sup>21</sup>** *Apa* Moses is said to have fallen victim to the Mazikoi in 407. Palladius, *Historia Lausiaca*, 19.1.

<sup>22</sup> On this Libyan tribe, which periodically was responsible for attacks and sacks, above all in the Western oases, killing and enslaving the Egyptian inhabitants of both villages and

undoubtedly refer to the second half of the fourth century or to the beginning of the fifth. More ephemeral are of course the protagonists, Maximus and Domitius – on whose tomb would have been built a little church, first nucleus of the Monastery of the Romans,<sup>23</sup> one of the monastic communities of the Wādī el-Naṭrūn, where most of the narrative is set – but this is part of the fiction of the literary genre of *bioi*.

# 2 The account of the itinerant life of the work and its value

One of the most striking passages of the second part of our title is the clarification that Pshoi wrote the *Life* of the saints on a papyrus roll (AOMOC NXAPTHC),<sup>24</sup> a book form that might appear surprising for a manuscript culture whose main bibliological product is the codex, but that now – in the light of a systematic census of the book forms of Coptic literary tradition – sounds perfectly credible. Thirteen horizontal rolls<sup>25</sup> and twelve vertical rolls (or *rotuli*)<sup>26</sup> are currently known, without taking into consideration those used for documentary texts, which are much more numerous.

All the extant literary rolls are datable between the fourth and the beginning of the sixth centuries, therefore the information provided by the title is certainly credible. It is not specified whether or not the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* was the only work contained in the roll, but this is very likely.

According to the title, when the Wādī el-Naṭrūn was looted and devastated by the Mazikoi, during one of their periodical incursions, *Apa* Isidorus would have brought the book to the 'Xenon'.

The term surely refers to a *xeneôn* or *xenodokheion*, an institution used for the purposes of accommodating and giving assistance to disadvantaged people,

monasteries, see Modéran 2003, 88, 89, 93, 99, 102, 119, 154, 162 (n.), 167, 168 (the map 'La migration vers l'Orient des Maziques et des Ausuriens entre 398 et 412–413 selon D. Roques'), 170, 172, 187 (n.), 192 (n.), 218, 266–267, 340 (n.), 454, 467 (n.), 468, 482, 579, 649–650, 729, 778 (n.). See also Boozer 2013, 275–292.

**<sup>23</sup>** Toward the end of the *Life of Maximus and Domitius*, we read: 'After that Macarius the Great spoke in the church, saying: "Call this place quarter (PAYH) of the Romans".

**<sup>24</sup>** For the meaning of AoMoc as 'roll' see Lampe 1961, 1396 and Liddell and Scott 1968. See also, for example among the several cases, PSI 10.1146.1 (second century CE).

<sup>25 &</sup>lt;a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/search/manuscripts/saved?q=horizontal\_rolls">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/search/manuscripts/saved?q=horizontal\_rolls</a>>.

**<sup>26</sup>** <a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/search/manuscripts/saved?q=vertical\_rolls">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/search/manuscripts/saved?q=vertical\_rolls</a>.

mainly foreign, as the etymology suggests (cf. hospitium). Xenodokheia ('places where foreigners are assisted') and ptôkeia/ptôkhotropheia ('places where the poor are fed') were already present in all the metropoleis of the Christian East in the first half of the fourth century. From a juridical point of view, they were private foundations directly controlled by the bishop, and therefore they represented his ability to be effective in managing philanthropic and charitable works, constituting a direct reflection of his power. Such organization of the assistance activities is a direct legacy of the practices and values of the ruling class of Roman and Byzantine societies, echoing the forma mentis of the traditional elite, which expressed its prestige also by means of leitourgiai, more or less mandatory.<sup>27</sup>

We know with certainty that Alexandria at the time of archbishop Teophilus (384–412) already had a *ptôkheion* and a *xenodokheion*, and also that Isidoros – very likely the same Isidorus mentioned in our title – was '*xenochos*, and a close collaborator of Theophilus. After using him on various occasions, Theophilus condemned him to leave Egypt (in 402)'.<sup>28</sup>

This means that the transfer of the manuscript from Scetis to Alexandria must have happened before the conflict between Isidorus and Theophilus and his subsequent exile. What is more interesting, however, is that our title seems to suggest that these types of institution have also had a (sort of) library, a fact that, as far as I know, was not otherwise known. Since this detail – the transfer of a book to a *xenodokheion* – is not at all obvious – on the contrary it is very surprising –, I would be inclined to take it seriously into account.

We then learn that the manuscript 'remained there until the time of *Apa* Khael', very likely to be identified with Michael I (743–767), who was from the Monastery of St Macarius (Scetis). During his long patriarchate, while stemming the harassment of the Islamic governor, he was able to keep control over the shrine of St Menas (against the Chalcedonians) and to restore the church of St Mark in Alexandria. He was thrown into prison by 'Abd al-Mālik ibn Marwān, when he discovered that Michael had contacts with the new king of Dongola,

**<sup>27</sup>** Fatti 2003a, 257-296: 260–261. See also the unpublished PhD dissertation, Fatti 2001, Calderini 1935, I, 138 ('Alessandria'); Martin 1996, 728; Hass 1997, 253 and 393 (n. 72); Wipszycka 2016, 248–250. Still valid, although not recent, is Constantelos 1968.

**<sup>28</sup>** Wipszycka 2016, 248, who also discusses his relationship with Palladius. See also Sozomen, *HE* 8.12. For the reconstruction of the life of Isidorus see Fatti 2003b, 283–435 and Fatti 2006, 105–139.

Cyriacus, a fact that might lie behind the epithet of 'the most holy archbishop' used in the title.<sup>29</sup>

Later – but it is not specified when – a deacon named Eustatios found it in

'a large storage box of old parchment books written in quaternions (оүноб мөнкө мжффме мапас еченг егентетрас мжффме ммемвранон), when he was looking among books that might have deteriorated over time (мжффме мтаур гооле етве пехронос)'.

On the basis of this sentence it seems safe to deduce that our manuscript would have remained for some time in a sort of limbo, with other books, old parchment codices, which had probably deteriorated due to the prolonged use. Eustatios seems to be in charge of the restoration of old books. It is not specified, however, if between the moment in which the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* reached the 'Xenon' and its discovery – certainly post mid-eighth century –, its book form changed, moving from a papyrus roll to a parchment codex, although it is plausible.

Restoration activities are never mentioned in other titles and also seem to be extremely rare in Coptic colophons. The only colophon that I know which mentions a restoration is that of Oxford, Bodleian Library, Clarendon Press, B40.1-2,<sup>30</sup> which reads:

[...] this restoration Basil(ios) a Scriptures ( $\Gamma PA\Phi H/\gamma \rho \alpha \phi \dot{\eta}$ )-lover, which wants that everyone could dedicate himself (to it), for this reason he restored ( $C\gamma N 2IC T A/\sigma UNIO T \tilde{\alpha}V$ ) this book after that it deteriorated.<sup>31</sup>

Eustatios later met 'a monk living in the Ennaton, who was from Scetis, and gave it to him. This is the way in which the life of those perfect saints of God was revealed'.

The Enaton/Ennaton is the famous monastery – or better, ensemble of monastic establishments, which however constituted a unique complex –, located on the strip separating the Mediterranean coast and the lake Mareotis, nine miles west of Alexandria, according to its etymology, on the way to the sanctuary

**<sup>29</sup>** Swanson 2010, 19–21; Elli 2003, II, 31–39. The identification of Khael with Michael II (849–851), who occupied the patriarchal seat for sixteen months is less probable because of the ephemeral nature of the historical figure and, above all, due to the fact that, in the opinion of the author of these pages, our title is older than the mid-ninth century.

<sup>30</sup> CLM 4196.

<sup>31</sup> Edition and translation by Agostino Soldati. See also van Lantschoot 1929, 126–127, no. lxxvi.

of St Menas.<sup>32</sup> Also known in Arabic as 'Monastery of the glass' or 'Monastery of the glass maker', the Ennaton was certainly a rich community, since it could take advantage of the economic activities taking place on both the sea and the lagoon.<sup>33</sup>

It is not clear from the title if the book was moved to the Ennaton or if it is in Alexandria that Eustatios met the monk who lived in the Ennaton. The important fact, however, is that Eustatios is from Scetis and therefore thanks to this circumstance the circle closes: the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* – and the book that bears it – could go back to the place where it had been written by Pshoi.

The title which we are discussing and the related codex, however, are not from Scetis, but from the Fayyūm, and in particular from the Monastery of the Archangel Michael at Phantoou, as we said. Moreover, the codex also contains another work, that is the Martyrdom of Theodore the Anatolian (CC 0437), which means that, admitting that our title tells a true story – as I am inclined to think, because of the richness of historical and bibliological details that are not in the least obvious and appear to be based to a great extent on reality -, what we have is a codex derived from an antigraphon, very likely written in Scetis or making use of documents related to that milieu. The copyist operating in the Fayyūm must have found it so interesting that he decided to keep it, although all its unusual elements refer to another monastic context, that of the Wādī el-Natrūn. Does this mean that the Favyūmic Monastery of the Archangel Michael used book models from Scetis? We cannot say it with certainty. If this hypothesis were correct, it would remain to be explained, however, why the Bohairic title, contained in a codex from the Monastery of St Macarius, in the Wādī el-Natrūn itself, does not include these narrative elements. It is possible to surmise that the title of the Bohairic version is an older product, but this is not a very convincing hypothesis.

Yet, there is another possibility: the copyist operating in the Fayyūm could be the creator of the title – a fact that would be corroborated by the style and structure of several other long titles found in the codices from the Monastery of the Archangel Michael.<sup>34</sup> In this case the author would have been interested not so much in the events related to Scetis – in fact already contained in the original

**<sup>32</sup>** Other famous monastic centres of the Mediterranean coast were the Pempton, the Oktokaidekaton and the Metanoia.

**<sup>33</sup>** Gascou 1991, 954–958; Goehring 2018, 538. On the problem of the location of the monastery and for a rich bibliography related to its history and socio-political role, see Ghattas 2017, 37–47. See also <a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/places/118">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/places/118</a>>.

**<sup>34</sup>** Titles belonging to the categories named 'complex structure titles' and 'extended complex structure titles'.

nucleus of the title – as in those relating to Alexandria and its surroundings, events that he may have reconstructed on the basis of official or semi-official documentation, as the mention of Isidorus, the 'Xenon' of Alexandria and bishop Khael seem to demonstrate.

To conclude this brief reflection on an unusual story of a wandering book (Fig. 1) narrated by an exceptional title, it is important to stress that, even if the second part of the title was the fruit of a vivid imagination or a fictional construction, the historical knowledge of the author – because, of course, the creator of the title is an author himself – and his consciousness of the technological aspects of books and their metamorphoses over the centuries remain significant facts.

#### Acknowledgements

The present article is one of the scientific outcomes of the ERC Advanced project PAThs – 'Tracking Papyrus and Parchment Paths: An Archaeological Atlas of Coptic Literature. Literary Texts in their Geographical Context: Production, Copying, Usage, Dissemination and Storage', funded by the European Research Council, Horizon 2020 programme, project no. 687567, hosted by Sapienza Università di Roma, <a href="http://paths.uniroma1.it">http://paths.uniroma1.it</a>.

# **Abbreviations**

The following abbreviations and IDs are used in this article:

CC Clavis Coptica or Clavis Patrum Copticorum (the complete census of all Coptic literary works available online at <www.cmcl.it/~cmcl/chiam\_clavis.html>, and <https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/works>)

CLM Coptic Literary Manuscript (unique identifier of Coptic literary manuscripts attributed within the framework of the PAThs project and freely available

online at <a href="https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts">https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts</a>).

It is important to stress that, although other IDs were available for Coptic manuscripts, the introduction and systematic use of a CLM ID has become necessary because PAThs is currently the most exhaustive database of literary codicological units (<https://atlas.paths-erc.eu/manuscripts>). All the other existing ones, including CMCL, Trismegistos, LDAB and the List of Coptic Biblical Manuscripts, are of course extremely useful, but they refer to a more limited time span or focus on specific categories of manuscripts. In any case, they are always mentioned in the PAThs database, when available.

# References

- Andrist, Patrick (2018), 'Toward a definition of paratexts and paratextuality: The case of ancient Greek manuscripts', in Liv Ingeborg and M. Maniaci (eds), *Bible as Notepad: Tracing Annotations and Annotation Practices in Late Antique and Medieval Biblical Manuscripts* (Manuscripta Biblica, 3), Berlin: De Gruyter, 130–149.
- Boozer, Anna Lucille (2013), 'Frontiers and Borderlands in Imperial Perspectives: Exploring Rome's Egyptian Frontier', *American Journal of Archaeology*, 117/2: 275–292.
- Buzi, Paola (2001), 'The Life of Maximus and Domitius: Considerations for a Reconstruction of the Cultural Life of Western Lower Egypt in the Late Coptic Age', *Augustinianum*, 2: 521–544.
- Buzi, Paola (2004), 'Titles in the Coptic Manuscript Tradition: Complex Structure Titles and Extended Complex Structure Title', in Coptic Studies on the Threshold of a New Millennium.

  Proceedings of the Seventh International Congress of Coptic Studies, Leiden, 27 August 2 September 2004 (Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta, 133), Leuven: Peeters, vol. 1, 309–316.
- Buzi, Paola (2005), *Titoli ed autori nella tradizione copta. Studio storico e tipologico* (Biblioteca degli 'Studi di Egittologia e di Papirologia', 2), Pisa: Giardini Editori e Stampatori in Pisa.
- Calderini, Aristide (1935), *Dizionario dei nomi geografici e topografici dell'Egitto greco-romano*, vol. 1, Milan: Cisalpino Goliardica.
- Ciotti, Giovanni, Michael Kohs, Eva Wilden, Hanna Wimmer and the TNT Working Group (2018), 'Definition of Paracontent' <a href="http://www.manuscript-cultures.uni-hamburg.de/papers\_e.html">http://www.manuscript-cultures.uni-hamburg.de/papers\_e.html</a> (accessed on 3 Feb. 2021).
- Constantelos, Demetrios J. (1968), *Byzantine Philanthropy and Social Welfare*, New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press [2nd revised edn: New Rochelle 1991].
- Coquin, René-George (1991), 'Pshoi, Saint', in Aziz S. Atiya (ed.), *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, New York: Macmillan, vol. 6, 2028-2030.
- Depuydt, Leo (1993), Catalogue of the Coptic Manuscripts in the Pierpont Morgan Library, 2 vols, Leuven: Peeters.
- Elli, Alberto (2003), *Storia della Chiesa Copta*, 3 vols, Cairo: The Franciscan Centre of Christian Oriental Studies.
- Emmel, Stephen (2005), 'The Library of the Monastery at Phantoou (al-Hamuli)', in Gawdat Gabra (ed.), *Christianity and Monasticism in the Fayoum Oasis*, Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 63–70.
- Fatti, Federico (2001), *L'edilizia filantropica cristiana nell'Oriente Tardo Antico*, PhD thesis, 2 vols. Università di Torino.
- Fatti, Federico (2003a), 'Tra Costantinopoli e Alessandria: l'edilizia filantropica cristiana al Concilio di Calcedonia', *Cristianesimo nella storia*, 24: 257–296.
- Fatti, Federico (2003b), "Eretico, condanna Origene!" Conflitti di potere ad Alessandria nella tarda antichità', *Annali di storia dell'esegesi*, 20: 283–435.
- Fatti, Federico (2006), 'Trame mediterranee: Teofilo, Roma, Costantinopoli', *Adamantius*, 12: 105–139.
- Friedrich, Michael and Cosima Schwarke (2016), One-Volume Libraries: Composite and Multiple-Text Manuscripts (Studies in Manuscript Cultures, 9), Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Gascou, Jean (1991), 'Enaton, The', in Aziz S. Atiya (ed.), *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, New York: Macmillan, vol. 3, 954–958.

- Ghattas, Mary (2017), 'Toward the Localization of the Hennaton Monastic Complex', in Gawdat Gabra and Hany N. Takla (eds), *Christianity and Monasticism in Northern Egypt: Beni Suef, Giza, Cairo, and the Nile Delta*, Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press, 37–47.
- Goehring, James E. (2018), 'Ennaton, Monastery of', in Oliver Nicholson (ed.), *The Oxford Dictionary of Late Antiquity*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, vol. 1, 538.
- Hass, Christopher (1997), Alexandria in Late Antiquity. Topography and Social Conflict, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Lampe, Geoffrey W. H. (1961), A Patristic Greek Lexicon, Oxford: Clarendon.
- Liddell, Henry John, and Robert Scott (1968), A Greek English Lexicon, Oxford: Clarendon.
- Nakano, Chièmi (2006), 'Indices d'une chronologie relative des manuscrits coptes copiés à Toutôn', *Journal of Coptic Studies*, 8: 147–159.
- Marava-Chatzinicolaou, Anna and Christina Toufexi-Paschou (1978), Katalogos mikrografiōn Buzantinōn cheirografōn tēs ethnikēs Bibliothēkēs tēs Hellados Κατάλογος μικρογραφιῶν Βυζαντινῶν χειρογράφων τῆς Ἐθνικῆς Βιβιλιοθήκης τῆς Ἑλλάδος, vol. 1, Athens: Grafeion Dēmosieumatōn tēs Akadēmias Athēnōn Γραφεῖον Δημοσιευμάτων τῆς Ἀκαδημίας Ἀθηνῶν.
- Martin, Annick (1996), Athanase d'Alexandrie et l'Église d'Égypte au IVe siècle (328-373) (Collection de l'École Française de Rome, 216), Rome: École française de Rome.
- Modéran, Yves (2003), *Les Maures et l'Afrique romaine (IV<sup>e</sup>-VII<sup>e</sup> siècle)* (Bibliothèque des Écoles Françaises d'Athènes et de Rome, 314), Rome: École française de Rome.
- Piovanelli, Pierluigi (1993), 'Les origines de l'*Apocalypse de Paul* reconsidérées', *Apocrypha*, 4: 25–64.
- Piovanelli, Pierluigi (2000), 'The miraculous discovery of the hidden manuscript: or the paratextual function of the prologue to the "Apocalypse of Paul", in George Booke (ed.), *La narrativité dans la Bible et les textes apparentés* (Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologicarum Lovaniensium, 149), Leuven: Peeters, 265–282.
- Regnault, Lucien (1991), 'Isidorus of Scetis, Saint', in Aziz S. Atiya (ed.), *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, New York: Macmillan, vol. 4, 1310.
- Swanson, Mark (2010), *The Coptic Papacy in Islamic Egypt, 641-1517*, Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press.
- van Lantschoot, Arnold (1929), Recueil des colophons des manuscrits chrétiens d'Égypte, vol. 1: Les colophons coptes des manuscrits sahidiques, Leuven: J. B. Istas.
- von Dobschütz, Ernst (1925), 'The Notices prefixed to Codex 773 of the Gospels', *Harvard Theological Review*, 18: 280–284.
- Wipszycka, Ewa (2016), *The Alexandrian Church. People and Institutions* (The Journal of Juristic Papyrology. Supplement, 25), Warsaw: Warsaw University.



Fig. 1: The stages of the original manuscript of the *Life of Maximus and Domitius* according to the Sahidic title. Map elaborated by Paolo Rosati, PAThs Team (October 2020).