

Numéro

63

Année 2017

GAZETTE
DU LIVRE
MÉDIÉVAL



bibles médiévales hébergeant un certain nombre d'outils pour la recherche ; à la base de données des Bibles hébraïques, s'ajoutera un répertoire de projets et d'informations concernant les bibles hébraïques médiévales (une bibliographie – en collaboration avec Viktor Golinetz, HFJS Heidelberg, des bibliothèques d'images) et toute information concernant d'autres aires culturelles mais jugée intéressante en relation aux manuscrits hébreux.

D'autres périodes de production de la Bible seront mentionnées car de nombreux travaux sur les fragments pré-bibliques de Qumran sont en cours ; le EAJS LAb Aix de 2016 (organisé par E. Attia, A. Perrot et S. Blapp) avait souligné l'intérêt du croisement des approches aux sources antiques et médiévales même si elles demeurent propres à des champs de recherche différents. Signalons que le projet *Textual History of the Hebrew Bible* (dir. Armin Lange, Université de Vienne) s'est rapproché du projet MBH concernant les manuscrits hébreux médiévaux. Commencé en septembre 2016, le projet est réalisé par une équipe pour l'instant réduite (le responsable et chargé de recherche et un assistant de recherche) et la base avec tables relationnelles est en cours de développement (appel d'offre passé). L'interopérabilité avec d'autres bases de données est une priorité ; des portails tel que Biblissima facilitent grandement ce travail. Il faut enfin souligner que l'engouement sur les bibles 'tardives' est perceptible en monde latin (Light & Polegh 2013 ; Ruzzier & Hermand 2015), mais aussi en monde hébraïque, comme le prouve le nombre croissant de projets concordants sur le sujet. Ainsi, l'Université d'Aix Marseille accueillera en résidence le chercheur Javier del Barco (CSIC Madrid), à l'IMÉRA en 2018. Cette résidence rendra possible une collaboration de projet à projet entre LEGARAD sur les bibles sépharades tardives et MBH sur les bibles ashkénazes avant 1300. Sur le projet, voir le site bientôt ouvert et le carnet <http://mbh.hypotheses.org>. — Élodie ATTIA-KAY, CPAF-TDMAM, Aix-Marseille Université/CNRS.

¶ NOT A WRITTEN WORD BUT GRAPHIC SYMBOLS. NOTAE: AN EVIDENCE-BASED RECONSTRUCTION OF ANOTHER WRITTEN WORLD IN PRAGMATIC LITERACY FROM LATE ANTIQUITY TO EARLY MEDIEVAL EUROPE — The research project NOTAE aims to investigate the presence of graphic symbols in documentary records as a historical phenomenon from Late Antiquity to early medieval Europe and represents the first attempt to conduct a research on such topic. 'Graphic symbols' are meant as graphic signs (including alphabetical ones) drawn as a visual unit in a written text and representing something other than a word. They therefore broadly cover the semantic spectrum of the Latin notae (signs) as opposed to litterae (letters of the alphabet). The sources — just indicated as 'documentary records' — are written texts generated for pragmatic purposes: as expressions of the pragmatic literacy in the meaning proposed by Malcom B. Parkes («literacy of one who has to read or write in the course of transacting any kind of business») they are therefore documentary records of all possible kinds (legal contracts, petitions, official letters, private letters, lists, authentications from relics etc.), survived in original or in contemporary copies on papyrus, wooden tablet, slate, parchment (inscriptions and graffiti are excluded) from the long period in question, for which we have to consider different levels of literacy and of documentary practice, and consequently different questions about production, use, storage and transmission of documentary records.

With the gradual introduction of signature and the increasing use of papyrus from the 4th. c., the presence of graphic symbols became widespread in legal documents as it already was in other written records (christian letters e.g.), and continued in post-Roman kingdoms as part of the same historical process of reception of the late antique documentary practice.

For the period in question the external feature of the graphic symbols is not particular noticeable within the graphic texture of the written text in Greek or Latin cursive. The 'technology' requested in drawing them is the same for writing a text: a human hand tracing thin lines. The physical act of drawing symbols in written documents had a major social impact, because, provided it was done in one's own hand, it placed on the same footing literates (professional scribes, bureaucrats, economic élites) and illiterates. For illiterates, it certainly meant a way of taking an active part in the writing process both in the late Roman state — that is in a Greek-Latin graphic and linguistic koinè — and in the post-Roman kindgoms as long as Latin functioned as language of 'vertical communication'. Latin remained the common language of communication for a long time in the West ; it ceased to have any effect as a language of vertical communication between the 8th. and 9th. centuries, at different times and phases in different parts of Europe: this represents the fundamental premise to assume the ability of illiterate listeners in the early medieval Europe to understand latin texts read aloud. It implies that illiterate people participating in legal proceedings in Merovingian France or in Lombard Italy or in Visigothic Spain were like illiterates of the late Roman state, and that graphic symbols drawn by illiterates in these circumstances in the historical span in question are comparable.

New in NOTAE Project is also the idea of considering the graphic execution of these symbols as a matter of the scribal culture, as — we could say — the 'other side' of the written world, and consequently as an object of palaeographical analysis. A tendency toward alphabetocentric bias characterizes palaeographical studies in general and it too often happens that what appears as something other than a written line is classified as 'doodle', if it is not immediately recognizable as 'alphabetical sign'. So it happens that 'doodles' are implicitly elevated by palaeographers to a fixed category of graphic objects, characterized by their certain ahistorical nature. The late antique and early medieval pragmatic literacy is, however, a historical issue; Therefore not a single written line on a document is to be presumed a priori as being considered merely decorative or superfluous drawn by literates or illiterates who were bored or thinking about something else rather than writing something significant. A thorough investigation of this 'other side' of the written world can therefore provide precious insights about the spread of literacy as a whole.

The available instances of graphic symbols will be investigated in their contemporary context as well as diachronically, bringing together methods developed in the fields of palaeography, diplomatics and history. Archaeology, sociolinguistics, social anthropology, history of christianity will also provide important methodological angles, in order to capture all the possible historical implications by studying their graphic execution as well as their models and cross-influences, their contexts and transmissions, and with the purpose to frame the category of 'illiterates' for each significant period and region involved in the wide historical and geographical span with which the project is engaged. Specific attention will be devoted also to the studies about the presence of symbols in manuscripts of the literary tradition, one of the most interesting research topics in recent years.

The Project pursues four main objectives within its general aim: 1. to provide an inventory as complete as possible of graphic symbols and a collection of their images, through the systematic inspection of all the documentary sources available for the period in question; 2. to study each graphic symbol in its context through a complete synchronic analysis, in order to classify, to interpret and to relate each symbol to its 'author', to the 'host' document, to the historical geographical context; 3. to create the NOTAE-Database, which will be primarily designed and implemented in order to work as a research tool of the Project; 4. to conduct comparative and diachronic studies on the basis of the results of the

objective 2 and employing the NOTAE-Database. Starting from the purpose to know 'who drew what', 'when and where', 'how and why', the project aims to historicizing graphic symbols as material traces left by human hands on the border between written and oral culture, educated literacy and poor graphic abilities of illiterates.

Beyond the four objectives mentioned above, significant contributions are expected about two unsolved problems in the specific field of Palaeography: the meaning of the complex graphic symbol, consisting of tachigraphic notes and crossed lines drawn as interlocking pieces, which appears in the notarial subscriptions of the greek private documents and the survival of tachigraphic notes and Tironian notes in the pragmatic literacy of the post-Roman West. The NOTAE project will impact greatly also on the studies in diplomatic semiotics of the high middle Ages: it will make clear the historical background of the symbols of that later period, in which there is no more 'vertical communication' in latin language between literate elites and the illiterates. And finally the NOTAE-Database as final result will represent a repository of graphic symbols collected in original documentary sources from Late Antiquity to early Middle Ages: an evidence-based historical and dynamic Atlas of a graphic inheritance from the past, which will be available to all those scholars, who will be somehow interested in these historical objects and in what they can still say as historical sources. NOTAE is an ERC funded Project (ERC-2017-Advanced Grant, n° 786572) hosted in Sapienza University of Rome, Department of 'History Cultures Religions', led by Antonella Ghignoli as Principal Investigator. — Antonella GHIGNOLI, Università di Roma La Sapienza.

¶ MEDIEVAL PUBLISHING FROM c. 1000 TO 1500 (ERC STARTING GRANT PROJECT 716538) – The project is setting out to discover how Latin authors in the West published their works during the period from roughly 1000 to 1500. The project is funded by the European Research Council, is based at the University of Helsinki, runs for five years, and will conclude in 2022. Its research hypothesis is that publication strategies were not a constant but were liable to change, and that different literary, social, institutional, and technical milieux fostered different approaches to publishing. That proposition is encapsulated in the different approaches taken by Ralph the Monk, towards the start of our period, and Leonardo Bruni towards the end. Ralph the Monk, an author from Normandy who ended his career in England in the early twelfth century, possessed limited control over the publication of his treatise *De peccatore*. The work was initially circulated without his permission. When Ralph subsequently reclaimed authorial ownership and formally published the work, publication was a petty event within only a small circle of monks. That experience contrasts profoundly with that of the publication of *Historiarum Florentini populi libri XII* by Leonardo Bruni (†1444). Bruni published his work in instalments. These acts constituted grand municipal events, sometimes associated with major civic festivities. So, where publishing might be mainly a semi-private business in the eleventh century, it could be a grand affair in the fifteenth. The act of publishing evolved over time, reacting to changes in the wider world.

We seek to make two contributions. The first concerns the study of Latin literature. The act of publishing completes the authorial process, and if one fails to appreciate that act, one's understanding of literature from any period will remain defective. The project, therefore, seeks to establish the key parameters for the process of publishing during its medieval period. Our investigations focus on the activities of authors, and secondarily of their circles, as they made preparations for the primary stages of circulation. Our case-studies build on the relevant historical record, text-critical evidence, and the physical

evidence of manuscripts. Autograph manuscripts and their primary copies are of especial significance as their combined evidence can reveal physical realities of the act of publication at first-hand. The project's time-frame, c. 1000–1500, is decided in part by the rate of the survival of such manuscripts; only a very few autographs and primary copies by authors' associates survive from the early-medieval period. Furthermore, our time-frame embraces Latin literary culture in its high-medieval maturity and its more complex late-medieval developments, down to the end of the incunable period, to allow some investigation of the ways in which publication strategies were changed by the arrival of print.

Our secondary aim is to complement the perception of societal and cultural changes that took place during the period from c. 1000 and 1500. For the purposes of that undertaking, we define 'publishing' as a social act, involving at least two parties, an author and an audience, not necessarily always brought together. The former prepares a literary work and then makes it available to the latter. Medieval publishing was probably more often a more complex process. It could engage more parties than the two, such as commentators, dedicatees, and commissioners. The social status of these networks ranged from mediocre to grand. They could consist of otherwise unknown monks; or they could include popes and emperors. We propose that the composition of such literary networks was broadly reactive to large-scale societal and cultural changes. If so, networks of publishing can serve as a vantage point for the observation of continuity and change in medieval societies. We shall identify and analyse publishing networks in various contexts in order to trace how their composition might have reflected the wider world.

The data of publishing networks will be made available in an online database, the working title of which is *Medieval Publication Database*. This database assembles agents of publishing, predominantly authors, dedicatees, and commissioners, but also other parties, such as commentators and copyists. They are identified by the attributes of name, time, place, social status, and professional and religious affiliation. The time-frame is set to encompass the medieval period in its entirety. The first goal is to include the said data from Britain and Ireland, a distinct geographical whole, whose medieval bibliography has been established *in toto* with considerable precision and coherence. The database will be searchable by means of the said attributes, providing for statistical analysis of publishing networks.

The project team currently comprises Samu Niskanen (PI), Jakub Kujawinski, Lauri Leinonen, and Jaakko Tahkokallio. The database is worked by its own team, supervised by Niskanen and Leinonen. The project website, to which a link to the *Medieval Publication Database* will be added in due course, can be found at the address <https://www.helsinki.fi/en/researchgroups/medieval-publishing>. The undersigned will be pleased to respond to any further enquiries. — SAMU NNISKANEN, Associate Professor of Medieval History, University of Helsinki.

GAZETTE DU LIVRE MÉDIÉVAL

Abonnements — Diffusion

« GAZETTE DU LIVRE MÉDIÉVAL »

C.N.R.S. – LAMOP • 7, rue Guy-Moquet
B.P. 8 — F-94801 VILLEJUIF CEDEX
e-mail : redaction@gazlimes.org

CONDITIONS D'ABONNEMENT

Abonnement annuel (fascicule unique) : 18,30 €

La collection intégrale des fascicules antérieurs est disponible
sur le portail Persée (www.persee.fr).

Règlement par virement bancaire, à l'ordre de :
Gazette du livre médiéval

Compte bancaire n° 30004/0293/015-550-39/25, B.N.P. Villejuif (Hôtel de Ville)
IBAN : FR76 3000 4002 9300 0015 5503 925 — BIC : BNPAFRPP1VR
(ou par chèque postal ou bancaire tiré sur un établissement français).

Important : Pour tout chèque tiré sur un établissement étranger, le montant du règlement
devra être majoré de 9,15 € pour couvrir les frais d'encaissement.

Des conditions spéciales sont consenties aux adhérents d'APICES
(Association paléographique internationale : culture – écriture – société)

Secrétariat : apices@cnrs-orleans.fr
<http://palaeographia.org/apices.htm>

Un formulaire d'abonnement est disponible sur Internet :

<http://www.gazlimes.org>

ainsi qu'une sélection d'articles et le sommaire détaillé
des fascicules parus depuis la création de la revue.

GAZETTE DU LIVRE MÉDIÉVAL

N° 63 — Année 2017

S O M M A I R E

‡ The early developments of hebrew scripts in north-western Europe [J. Olszowy-Schlanger]	1
‡ L'importance des sources de la période révolutionnaire pour la reconstitu- tion des bibliothèques médiévales [A. Shapovalova]	20
‡ Les reliures romanes de l'abbaye de Clairvaux [E. Lévêque]	41
‡ From field to frame [S. Fiddymant - M. Collins]	55
‡ Le rôle du parchemin dans la miniaturisation de la bible au XIII ^e siècle [C. Ruzzier]	64

Notes et discussions

Comparatio. À propos d'un nouvel outil à l'usage des liturgistes et musico- logues [C. Meyer]	79
--	----

Chronique

Travaux en cours, 82. — Vient de paraître – à paraître, 88. — *In memoriam*,
105. — Résumés, 110